# Appendix

## Provides for each category:

Rationale
Examples
Where to look for it in different teaching modalities
Professional Development Resources

## Category 1: The instructor shares current knowledge and scholarship of subject matter

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Defines and incorporates the vocabulary, language and thinking strategies of the discipline in the lesson.
- Presents content that reflects awareness of current trends and developments in the field.
- Demonstrates a capacity to be critical of knowledge itself.
- Models critical thinking for students.
- Uses examples of up-to-date knowledge that includes current theoretical frameworks in the field of study.
- Makes reference(s) to peer-reviewed scholarly works in the field of study.
- ….

### Where to look online:

- If it is a synchronous online course:
    - The instructor demonstrated familiarity with the technology that was incorporated in the lesson.

- if it is an asynchronous online course
    - Lesson module, including lesson materials and assignments, recorded lectures.
    - Comments on discussion board, blogs or other lesson spaces where students interact with the instructor, other students, or lesson content.
    - Announcement page

## Category 2: The instructor encourages active engagement between students and instructor.

### Rationale:

Frequent and timely student-instructor contact is an important factor in student motivation and involvement, particularly in a hybrid environment. Evidence of instructor concern helps students get through challenging situations and inspires them to persevere. Knowing a few instructors well enhances students' intellectual commitment and encourages them to think about their own values and future plans.

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Encourages students to share their questions, examples, and experiences
- Positively reinforces student participation
- Treats students as individuals, e.g., addresses students by name
- Incorporates student ideas into the class
- Checks individual and/or groups of students' understanding of the material/approach
- Thoughtfully critiques student contributions demonstrating respect for emerging expertise
- Pauses after asking questions
- Attends respectfully to student comprehension or puzzlement
- Explores topics in detail with students (rather than skimming by many ideas)
- …

## Additional examples* to look for if it is an asynchronous online environment: The instructor…

- Initiates contact with, or responds to, students on a regular basis in order to establish a consistent online presence.
- Uses a prominent announcement area to communicate important up-to-date lesson information to students, such as reminders of impending assignment due dates, curriculum changes, scheduled absences, etc.
- Responds to student inquiries in a timely manner (e.g., discussion board responses)
- Provides students with interaction space for study groups, "hallway conversations," etc.
- Uses a Q & A forum for students to post their questions regarding the session topic.
- Communication tools (discussion areas, e-portfolio, wiki, journal, chat rooms, social media spaces, etc.)
- Posted announcements
- Encourages the use of audio/chat/video/breakout rooms for communication.

## Resources:

- Creating Community - https://rise.articulate.com/share/bsZjpl8E4Df2C-iAydutCwtgkHcV4arY#/lessons/3iBpQO84vVP4KLnBnb6UJLmN0ucQpE6-
- Managing Your Online Class - http://facdev.e-education.psu.edu/teach/manage
- Icebreaker Ideas for Students Learning Remotely - https://www.uwb.edu/it/teaching/remote-instruction/icebreaker-ideas
- 50 Distance Learning Icebreakers and Games - https://www.vivifystem.com/blog/2020/6/1/icebreakers-for-distance-learning
- ELI Discovery Tool: Blended Learning Workshop Guide: Building Community and Collaboration- https://www.educause.edu/ir/library/pdf/ELI80073.pdf

## Category 3: The instructor develops reciprocity and cooperation among students.

### Rationale:

Learning is enhanced when it is more like a team effort than a solo race. Good learning, like good work, is collaborative and social, not competitive and isolated. Working with others often increases involvement in learning. Sharing one's own ideas and responding to others' reactions sharpens thinking and deepens understanding.

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor...

- Provides discussion prompts that help guide and elicit student participation in class discussion activities.
- Promotes group project and peer review.
- Asks students to critique and build upon classmates' contributions.
- Employs collaborative learning strategies and pedagogy.
- Encourages and fosters an active exchange of ideas and sharing of experiences among lesson participants.
- Facilitates class discussions by encouraging, probing, questioning, summarizing, etc.
- Has students work on problems in teams, designing group assignments so that students follow the basic tenets of cooperative learning (see resources, below) in order to avoid the common pitfalls of "group work"
- Encourages non-participating students to join activities and discussions
- Prevents specific students from dominating activities/discussions
- Guides the direction of discussions, mediating conflict or differences of opinion
- Provides regular opportunities for students to engage in one or more of the following activities: formal and/or informal discussions of lesson topics, collaborative lesson assignments, and study groups
- ...

### Additional examples* to look for in an online environment: The instructor...

- Encourages students to strengthen their online presence in the lesson by sharing links to their e-portfolios, personal Web sites, and/or photos of themselves to the class Web space (e.g., their LMS profile)
- Explains the criteria for “good” online discussion participation

- Provides Netiquette guidelines to ensure respectful interaction
- Models good online discussion participation practices
- Provides students with interaction space(s) for study groups, "hall way conversations," etc.
- Uses breakout rooms in Bb Collaborate or Zoom.

## Where to look online:

- Instructional materials / Assignment directions
- Communication tools (posted announcements, discussion areas, e-mail, chat rooms, social media spaces, etc.)
- Posted announcements
- Collaborative spaces (discussion board, group assignments, group projects, wikis, blogs, etc.)

## Resources:

- An Overview of Cooperative Learning - http://www.co-operation.org/what-is-cooperative-learning/
- Creating Community - https://rise.articulate.com/share/bsZjpl8E4Df2C-iAydutCwtgkHcV4arY#/lessons/3iBpQO84vVP4KLnBnb6UJLmN0ucQpE6-
- How-to Facilitate Robust Online Discussions - https://onlinelearninginsights.wordpress.com/2012/06/25/how-to-create-robust-discussions-online/

## Category 4: The instructor encourages active learning.

### Rationale:

Active learning methods engage students in the learning process by encouraging them to discover, process, and apply information. Empirical support for the positive impact of active learning on student achievement is extensive. (See Prince, M. (July 2004). Does active learning work? A review of the research. Journal of Engineering Education, 93, 3, 223-232.)

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Challenges or engages student assumptions
- Models thinking and problem-solving; works through problems, scenarios, arguments with students
- Designs authentic learning activities that help students make a meaningful connection to the real world.
- Incorporates learning from field and clinical experiences
- Assigns student activities that involve one or more of the following:
    - active use of writing, speaking, and other forms of self-expression
    - opportunity for information gathering, synthesis, and analysis in solving problems (including the use of library, electronic/computer and other resources, and quantitative reasoning and interpretation, as applicable)
    - engagement in collaborative learning activities
    - Encourages students to engage in critical thinking
    - application of intercultural and international competence
    - dialogue pertaining to social behavior, community, and scholarly conduct
    - thinking, talking, or writing about their learning
    - reflecting, relating, organizing, applying, synthesizing, or evaluating information
    - performing research, lab or studio work, or physical activities
    - participating in, designing, or developing educational games and simulations
    - Provides opportunities for students to “customize” assignments to their personal and professional interests and needs
- …

## Where to look online:

- Instructional materials
- Assignments
- Communication tools (discussion areas, e-mail, chat panel, etc.)
- Polling, breakout rooms, whiteboard, Chat panel in Bb Collaborate Ultra or Zoom.
- Group work

## Resources:

- Strategies for Creating Engaging Synchronous and Asynchronous Learning Environments - https://weblearning.psu.edu/strategies-for-creating-engaging-synchronous-and-asynchronous-learning-environments/
- Engagement activities https://rise.articulate.com/share/bsZjpl8E4Df2C-iAydutCwtgkHcV4arY#/lessons/2qW4vDsRVpBlK3IoJ_EZxrfOUa86QRs8
- Active Learning - https://bokcenter.harvard.edu/active-learning
- Active Learning Techniques - https://crlt.umich.edu/sites/default/files/resource_files/Active%20Learning%20Continuum%20Techniques.pdf
- Engaging Activities - https://teachingcommons.stanford.edu/explore-teaching-guides/class-activities/engaging-activities
- Inquiry-based Learning - http://www.schreyerinstitute.psu.edu/pdf/IBL.pdf

## Category 5: The instructor gives prompt and constructive feedback.

### Rationale:

Instructors help students frequently assess their knowledge and competence and provide them with opportunities to perform, receive actionable suggestions, and reflect on their learning.

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Provides an option (or requirement) for students to submit drafts of assignments for instructor feedback.
- Provides meaningful feedback on student assignments that is provided within a publicized, and reasonable, time frame.
- Provides assignment feedback that is clear, positive, specific, and focused on observable behavior that can be changed.
- Clearly communicates assignment grading criteria.
- Surveys students to elicit feedback for lesson improvement.
- Praises/acknowledges responses from the class.
- Helps students to extend their responses.
- Uses positive reinforcement.
- Asks student teams to read each other's homework and critique.
- Structures discussions of material based on feedback on students' understanding.
- Uses rubrics to set clear expectations and explicitly connect feedback to the expectations.
- …

### Additional examples* to look for in an online environment: The instructor…

- Gives students access to an up-to-date lesson gradebook.
- Provides an open discussion forum where students can ask questions, and receive instructor feedback, about lesson content and activities.
- Shares examples of student work that demonstrate advancement toward learning goals.

- Provides opportunities for practice with feedback such as interactive self-assessments or narrated demonstrations of how to solve mathematical problems.
- Provides prompt, test/quiz/assignment feedback, or grading rubrics

## Where to look online:

- Instructional materials / Assignment directions
- Assignments and e-portfolios
- Discussion forums
- Survey instruments

## Additional examples* to look for in the face-to-face classroom: The instructor…

- Has students work problems on the board.
- Actively monitors group activities, e.g., asking questions, offering help).

## Resources:

- Seven Keys to Effective Feedback - http://www.ascd.org/publications/educational-leadership/sept12/vol70/num01/Seven-Keys-to-Effective-Feedback.aspx
- 5 Research-based Tips for Providing Students with Meaningful Feedback - http://www.edutopia.org/blog/tips-providing-students-meaningful-feedback-marianne-stenger
- Howard E. Aldrich. 2002. “Your Paper’s on the Floor, Outside My Door.” National Teaching & Learning Forum, 12, 1: 10.

## Category 6: The instructor emphasizes time on task.

### Rationale:

The frequency and duration of study and effective time management skills are critical for students and professionals alike. Students need help in learning to manage and prioritize their study time.

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Provide the schedule for the observed week that outlines topics to be covered and assignment due dates.
- Provides session-specific study tips that provide students with strategies for utilizing their time well.
- Provides assignment feedback that gives students with information on where to focus their studies.
- Considers the nature of the student audience when considering assignment due dates and timeframes, e.g., a lesson targeted to working adult professionals might incorporate a weekend into an assignment timeframe.
- Makes announcements to the class addressing upcoming assignments and exams.
- Provides explicit directions for active learning tasks, e.g., rationale, duration, product.
- Allows sufficient time to complete tasks, such as group work. Makes sure students understand task requirements and expectations.
- Makes sure students are given ample time to complete assignments and respond to discussion board
- ….

### Additional examples* to look for in the online environment: The instructor…

- Gives time-to-completion information on lesson assignments, e.g., “This assignment should take you approximately 2 hours to complete.”
- Shares lesson statistics that demonstrate that time-to-completion and time-on-task estimates are on target.

### Where to look online:

- Instructional materials / Assignment directions

- Assignment due dates
- Additional examples* to look for in the face-to-face classroom: The instructor models time on task and organization skills by:
- Arriving to class on time
- Providing an outline or organization for the class session
- Following the stated structure
- Completing the scheduled topics

## Resources:

- Time Management: Five Essentials for Online Learners - https://www.worldcampus.psu.edu/about-us/news-and-features/time-management-five-essentials-for-online-learners
- Adjusting Your Study Habits - https://keeplearning.psu.edu/topics/study-habits/
- Online Course Design: Time on Task - https://www.rit.edu/academicaffairs/tls/sites/rit.edu.academicaffairs.tls/files/docs/Course%20Design_Online_Time%20%20on%20Task_v1.5.pdf
- Module (for students) on Time Management - http://tutorials.istudy.psu.edu/timemanagement/
- How Students Develop Online Learning Skills - https://er.educause.edu/articles/2007/1/how-students-develop-online-learning-skills

# Category 7: The instructor communicates high and reasonable expectations.

## Rationale:

As the saying goes, “if you don’t know where you are going, how will you know when you get there?” Effective instructors have high, but reasonable, expectations for their students. They clearly communicate those expectations and provide support to their students in their efforts to meet those expectations.

## Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Explicitly communicates the skills and knowledge every student needs to have in order to be successful.
- Explains learning goals and how assignments are designed to help students achieve those goals.
- Uses rubrics to assess student learning.
- Provides frequent feedback to students through written explanations on assignments.
- Motivates and encourages students to inspire them to move past the easy answers to more complex solutions.
- Routinely uses critical and probing questions when communicating with students about assignments and activities.
- Encourages students to engage in critical thinking.
- Provides examples and non-examples of high-quality work, along with a discussion of the differences between these.
- Provides examples of student work that demonstrate advancement toward learning goals.
- Corrects misguided responses or redirects obvious or easy questions.
- Relates this and previous class(es), or provides students with an opportunity to do so.
- Conveys the purpose of each class activity or assignment.
- Elaborates on or repeats complex information.
- Notes new terms or concepts.
- Communicates the reasoning process behind operations and/or concepts.
- Encourages students to challenge themselves with differentiated instructions.
- ….

## Where to look online:

- Instructional materials / Assignment directions
- Assignments
- Availability of grading rubrics, sample work

## Additional examples* to look for in the face-to-face classroom: The instructor…

- Provides class goals or objectives for the class session.
- Pauses during explanations to ask and answer questions.

## Resources:

- Maximizing the Student Learning Experience (see "Working with Learning Objectives") https://rise.articulate.com/share/bsZjpl8E4Df2C-iAydutCwtgkHcV4arY#/lessons/cD18_bj_pB5LiSM3ZA33RB7ycUyxHpcb
- Resources related to writing clear learning objectives - http://www.schreyerinstitute.psu.edu/Tools/?q=Learning%20Objective
- Authentic Assessment in Online Education - https://sites.google.com/site/designingcoursesonline/home/authentic-assessment-in-online-education
- Using Rubrics - https://rise.articulate.com/share/bsZjpl8E4Df2C-iAydutCwtgkHcV4arY#/lessons/lzf4100KXGa7XPYFNOsehM6MKjXRY4Qr
- Writing Great Assignment Instructions: Tips for Success - https://online.une.edu/blog/writing-great-assignment-instructions-tips-success/?cn-reloaded=1
- Syllabus Requirements for EMS Blended and Online Courses - https://facdev.e-education.psu.edu/teach/onlinesyllabus

## Category 8: The instructor respects diverse talents and ways of learning.

### Rationale:

People bring different talents and styles of learning to the learning environment. Some bring a wealth of relevant experience to a lesson, while others may be new to the topic at hand. Likewise, students who are strong in a discussion situation may be less adept at lab or studio work. Students need the opportunity to demonstrate their talents and to "personalize" their learning so that it is relevant to them. It is also important to give students opportunities to learn in ways that may be less comfortable in order to improve their learning skills.

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Uses of a variety of assessment tools that gauge student progress.
- Provides alternative assignment options that allow students to demonstrate their progress in a manner that is best conducive to their talents, e.g., a podcast might be allowed as learning evidence instead of a written paper.
- Provides timely, corrective feedback for learning activities.
- Proactively offers accommodations for students with disabilities.
- Uses more than one form of instructions.
- Provides opportunities and time for students to practice.
- Provides a variety of examples and contexts to evoke interest in students with a diversity of identity characteristics.
- Encourages comments and questions from students with a diversity of identity characteristics.
- Identifies diverse sources, perspectives, and authorities of the field
- Designs assessment tools that give students opportunities to show talents from varied perspectives.
- ….

### Additional examples* to look for in the online environment: The instructor…

- Provides supplemental online materials for students who lack prerequisite knowledge or who would benefit from having content presented in an alternative manner.
- Creates a positive online climate where students are encouraged to seek assistance with lesson content and learning activities if needed.

- Provide visual presentation of lessons and tasks and accessibility (for the visually impaired, for example)

## Where to look online:

- Instructional materials / Assignment directions
- Assignments
- Discussion forums

## Additional examples* to look for in the face-to-face classroom: The instructor….

- Uses various instructional technologies to bring multiple sensory dimensions to the classroom.

## Resources:

- Learning effectively by understanding your learning preferences - http://www.mindtools.com/mnemlsty.html
- Classroom Assessment Techniques - https://cft.vanderbilt.edu/guides-sub-pages/cats/
- Accessibility and Usability at Penn State - http://accessibility.psu.edu/
- Office of Disability Services Faculty Handbook - http://equity.psu.edu/ods/faculty-handbook

## Category 9: The instructor displays clear lesson organization and presentation

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Provides module or class session learning objectives.
- Presents lesson materials and assignments in a logical sequential order.
- ….

### Where to look online:

- If in Zoom, closed captioning is turned on
- Lesson module, including lesson materials and assignments.
- Organizes the lesson materials and assignments that are easy to find.

## Category 10: The instructor demonstrates promotion of usability

### Examples* of evidence to look for: The instructor…

- Provides alternative means of access to audios and videos such as closed captioning, transcripts.
- Provides accessible text and images in files, documents, and lesson pages.
- Ensures the readability of the lesson.
- Present materials in fonts, colors, and sizes that are easy to read.
- The instructor’s voice is audible and clear.
- Provides transcripts of lectures for students who need it.
- ….

### Where to look online:

- if it is a synchronous online course:
- Live class meeting or recording of the class meeting.
- if it is an asynchronous online course:
- Lesson module including lesson materials and assignment instructions.

## Sources

The revision draws on the listed sources linked below:

+ http://www.psc-cuny.org/contract/article-18-professional-evaluation

+ https://www.cuny.edu/coronavirus/academic-continuity/guidance-on-academic-continuity-to-campuses/#Conducting-Faculty-Observations

+ https://facdev.e-education.psu.edu/evaluate-revise/peerreviewonline